Summary of the "Global Competency and Outcomes Framework for Universal Health Coverage" Workshops

1) First workshop: 19 January, 2023

The first workshop was conducted on 19 January, 2023 at Riverine Place Hotel and Residence, Nonthaburi Province. There were thirty-seven individuals joining including twenty-six participants two speakers, two speaker assistants, four facilitator, two rapporteurs, and one project member. Of twenty-six participants, nineteen were from Bangkok and seven were from other provinces.

Speakers shared presentations on global competencies domains 1-6 and details including 1) People-centeredness, 2) Decision-making, 3) Communication, 4) Collaboration, 5) Evidence-informed practice, and 6) Personal conduct. All domains were elaborated according to the framework.

Thailand has been recognized as a developing country which has established UHC scheme in 2002 and gradually succeeded the implementation through collaborative movements of health and non-health sectors. However, Thailand still faces challenge in making the systems sustainable, affordable, accessible and efficient. Thailand need to develop specific areas of competencies for health professionals to improve UHC as follow:

- Primary healthcare system: Health professionals should be familiar with the principles and practices of primary healthcare, including community-based care, health promotion, disease prevention, and management of common health problems.

- Preparedness for global health emergencies and health security: With the increasing threats of pandemics such as Covid-19 and other global health emergencies such as natural and human-induced disasters, health professionals need to be prepared to respond to such situations and ensure that health systems are resilient and adaptable.

- Disease resistance: Health professionals should understand the mechanisms of disease resistance, including vaccination, antimicrobial stewardship, and infection control practices in both urban or rural areas.

- Population health: Health professionals should be aware of the health status of the population and the factors that contribute to health disparities, including social determinants of health. It is important for health professionals to understand the health status of the population they work with in order to plan and provide health care to meet their health needs and achieve health outcomes.

- Determinants of health: Health professionals should have a broad understanding of the determinants of health, including behavioral, social, economic, and environmental factors.

- Health promotion and disease prevention: Health professionals should be equipped with skills necessary for promoting healthy behaviors and preventing diseases through interventions such as screening, counseling, and health education. Health professionals should encourage people to take care of their health, instead of relying on doctors and hospitals.

- Interprofessional education and collaborative practice: Health professionals should be trained to work collaboratively with other healthcare professionals to provide comprehensive and patient-centered care.

- Patient safety and quality of care: Health professionals should understand the principles of patient safety and quality improvement and be able to apply them in their practice. They should comply with quality management and quality improvement guideline provided by Hospital Accreditation (HA) system.

• Social responsibility: Health professionals should be aware of their social responsibilities to their patients, communities, and society as a whole, including ethical principles and professional standards. As part of society, they could collaborate with other sectors such as business sectors and civil society to improve patients' quality of life when possible.

• Human rights-based approaches to health promotion: Health professionals should be aware of human rights principles and be able to apply them in their practice, including respect for patient autonomy and informed consent. To achieve health equity, they should provide services to patients regardless of their ages, races, cultures, beliefs, genders, sexual orientations, gender expressions, and other dimensions of identity.

• Digital and other technologies: Health professionals should be familiar with the use of digital technologies in healthcare, including electronic health records, telemedicine, and mobile health applications. During Covid-19 pandemic, health professionals utilized digital and other technologies to deliver cares to patients including telemedicine, video consultation, delivery of medicine through post services. Health professional institutions had also adopted digital technologies in their learning. These lessons should be developed further for prepare health professionals to deal with any health emergencies and respond to population health needs in the future.

• Lifelong learning: Health professionals should be committed to lifelong learning and professional development to stay up-to-date with advances in healthcare and maintain their competencies over time and provide services using state-of-art healthcare innovations to patients.

Participants were divided into groups to discuss the six domains on what contents, approaches and methods teachers might want in their courses/classes to help their students acquire competencies necessary for implementing and achieving UHC. Participants shared their ideas and perspectives based on their experiences in teaching health professional students in institutions, health facilities and communities. After extensive discussions, they presented the six domains as follows:

Domain	Competencies	Contents/Approaches/Methods needed

Domain 1: People-centeredness	1. People-centered approach
	2. Community empowerment
	3. Culturally sensitive, respectful and compassionate care
	4. Holistic care
		- Understanding, learning from and merging with community by collecting information surveying, analyzing data, identifying community's health problems, and solving the problems by involving community in the process of thinking, deciding, and solving health problems.
		
		- Develop learners' soft skills especially communication skills such as deep listening, empathic conversation, and reflections.
		
		- Develop learners' soft skills such as active and empathetic listening, and deep listening skills in order to understand diverse cultures and others' boundaries with an open mind. Be friendly, show empathy, and don't judge.
		
		- Encourage learners to develop positive communication, creativity, and relationship-building skills to establish trust and cooperation in caring for their own health.
		
		- Promote health literacy among people by communicating health information and enabling people to:
		  o Access - support people to access health information and check for credibility before using the information to understand their own health problems.
		  o Understand - allow people and community to analyze their strengths, limitations, and weaknesses to understand their own health situations with friendliness and empathy.
		  o Question - create opportunities for people to ask questions and negotiate, recognizing that they are an individual with

Domain	Competencies	Contents/Approaches/Methods needed
		dignity and respect.
		o Make decisions - involve people and community in making decisions and taking responsibility for their own health.
		- Community can participate in all stages of the assessment and evaluation process of holistic care on voluntary basis.
		- Develop learners' communication skills emphasizing deep listening and humanized care.
		- Teachers will be good role models in health leadership by promoting individuals, families, and communities to participate in every process of planning for self-care, health promotion, disease prevention, and rehabilitation.
		- Promote learners' ability to apply theories to real-life situations, contributing to the integration of theories with personal contexts.
Domain 2: Decision-making	5. Adaptive collaborative and rigorous decision-making 6. Systematic decision-making 7. Solution-oriented approach 8. Adaptive and flexible to unexpected or changing situations	- Develop thinking, decision-making, and problem-solving, skills using teaching methods such as simulation-based learning, case studies, reflection, etc. - Prepare learners to have knowledge and skills in reading, researching information from reliable sources, and keeping up to date with changing situations. Learners should be able to check, analyze, summarize, and make timely decisions and solve problems. - Encourage individuals, families, and communities to understand self-care in a reflective manner, emphasizing participation and empowering service providers to care for themselves (appropriate to the context of the individual's resources, potential, finances, etc.)
Domain 3: Communication	9. Relationship management 10. Effective communication 11. Active listening 12. Purposeful information 13. Information sharing management	- Comprehend why communication is necessary – make learners understand that they have to achieve mutual goal in providing best care to patients. Communication is important in building relationship in health-teams or between practitioners and patients. - Communicate to understand themselves or others and show support to each other. Understand communication space and choose appropriate communication methods for effective outcomes. - Learn how to communicate effectively through the following communication approaches: o Deep listening o Non-violent communication o I-message communication o Negotiation o Space management o Self-esteem o Questioning - Learning methods o Role-play o VDO Clips of good and poor communication examples o Panel discussions o Problem-based learning o Reflection o Simulation o Special events

Domain	Competencies	Contents/Approaches/Methods needed
		o Community practice

Domain 4: Collaboration	14. Partner engagement
	15. Trusted partnerships
	16. Learning from, with, and about others
	17. Tensions and conflicts management
		- Understand why working together as a team is crucial – the team share common goal that need the team to work together and lead to clear outcomes
		- Learn how to work together effectively through the following approaches:
		  o Self-awareness - know oneself well first.
		  o Communication skills - communication skills are essential.
		  o Share vision - create a shared vision
		  o Space and mechanism of work - create space and mechanisms for working together
		  o Monitoring system - evaluate internally
		- Understand What will make teamwork possible through the following approaches:
		  o Team-based learning - create team-based learning processes for both teachers and students
		  o IPE (Inter-professional education)
		  o Special projects
		  o Community engagement
		  o Community practice

Domain 5: Evidence-informed practice	18. Evidence-informed practice
	19. Data and information assessment
	20. Culture of safety and continuous quality improvement
		- Understand why working together as a team is crucial – the team share common goal that need the team to work together and lead to clear outcomes
		- Aware of evidence-based practicing at all times through learning in classes and service learning as follow:
		  o Provide learners with evidence-based knowledge in Year 1 and 2, and continuously review and use the evidence-based knowledge in clinical practice
		  o Use the best available evidence in current practice
		  o Promote practice based on evidence among colleagues
		  o Participate in creating and using evidence
		- Set requirements for using additional data by:
		  o Teach information retrieval skills
		  o Have students set outcomes that align with national policies
		  o Teach students to analyze the credibility of knowledge
		  o Teach students how to access trustworthy databases
		  o Plan information retrieval and credibility analysis
		- Promote access to information and evidence by promoting access to data sources from other countries. The university may provide databases for this purpose
		- Seek information and evidence from multiple sources, and collaborate between libraries of different institutions
		- Evaluate limitations, quality, relevance, and importance of information and evidence with sound judgment
		- Manage the risk of potential harm from erroneous data
		- Implement security measures to prevent unwanted incidents, errors in care and unsafe practices.
		- Learn from both beneficial actions and mistakes.
		- Provide recommendations for improvement to address issues encountered.
		  o Contribute to continuous quality assessment and improvement processes, such as:

Domain	Competencies	Contents/Approaches/Methods needed
		o Bedside teaching for Case study o Involve students in quality assessment o Analyzing case reports for treatment improvement. o Host death conferences to identify weak points in real-life care and find ways to improve processes o Improve patient care o Emphasize health promotion and community rehabilitation o Have clear guidelines in the curriculum o In community pharmacy, addressing issues arising from medication use, not just dispensing o Manage risk in all dimensions
Domain 6: Personal conduct	21. Competence and scope of practice awareness 22. Ethical conduct 23. Lifelong learning and reflective practice 24. Health and well-being management	- Be aware of one's abilities as follows: o Have clear job boundaries, such as what a practicing nurse can do o Comply with professional standards o Reflect on roles and job boundaries o Visit actual working place to assess if it suits their working preferences o Point out the differences and limitations of health issues such as geographical location, socio-economic contexts, and evaluate how to manage the situations - Uphold responsibilities, obligations, and standards that comply with professional and legal standards. - Seeking solutions when faced with situations beyond one's abilities or scope of work. o Have problem-solving skills o Participate in service learning in real-life situations o Apply experience to different situations o Diversify internship contexts, which will help learners to develop risk management abilities o Reflect on the health problems to determine their root causes - Take actions with honesty, integrity, and transparency by: o Create groups to address and resolve situations o Develop a mindset of honesty o Create good working environment abiding by regulations and rules o Be a good role model as a teacher o Deny gifts (possible bribery) - Develop and engage in lifelong learning and reflective thinking o Participate in extracurricular activities related to responsibilities learners would tale in the present and the future o Self-learning and reflective practices o Learn to manage negative attitudes, behaviors, and fill gaps in skills or practices. - Maintaining physical, mental, and social well-being by: o Observe one's own mental health, physical health, and social well-being status o Use a variety of strategies to manage fatigue, poor health, stress, and the impact of difficult and urgent situations, such as meditation and joining clubs for health-related activities like music and aerobic exercise o Seek help or support for health and well-being, find places to relax, seek counseling, and provide tools and equipment o Take care of oneself, which will help to recover emotionally, physically, and socially

Speakers concluded that to achieve UHC, health professional should not only acquire knowledge, but also develop ability to adapt knowledge in real-life situation. They need to understand how to take action in different situations and different communities they work with. It is necessary for teachers to create experiences for learners within the healthcare system.

From workshop feedback survey, most participants rated highly satisfied for the workshop's content, speakers, activities, logistics, duration. They also had change to connect with other participants from different professions and different institutions.

2) Second workshop: 20 February, 2023

The second workshop was conducted on 20 February, 2023 at Riverine Place Hotel and Residence, Nonthaburi Province. There were thirty-four individuals joining including twenty-two participants, two speakers, four facilitator, four rapporteurs, one project member, and on one WHO officer. Of twenty-three participants, fourteen from Bangkok and eight from other provinces.

Speakers share information and discussed that there are several global health agenda that Thailand adopted and have been implemented to increased health outcomes. The Alma-Ata Declaration on "Health for all by the year 2000" in 1987, which identified primary healthcare as a key to achieving health equity. Thailand has successfully implemented this strategy. Then, the Ottawa Charter in 1986 introduced the concept of health promotion, which consists of five action areas that are still relevant today. The Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) in 2000, which ended in 2015, aimed to improve health globally. In 2010, the Framework for Social Determinants of Health Equity was introduced to promote health equity, and in 2013, the Health in All Policies (HiAP) policy was introduced to emphasize the importance of considering health in all policies. The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) were introduced in 2015 by the United Nations, with a target for sustainable development by 2030. In 2018, the Astana Declaration was issued, which emphasized the importance of primary healthcare. Finally, in 2021, the Geneva Charter for Well-being was introduced, which discussed the changing global trend of health due to technological advancements.

Countries have been undertaking policies and measures to achieve Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). SDG 3, being highly relevant to the health profession, should be the responsibility of healthcare agencies. However, addressing the issues related to SDG 3 cannot be accomplished by a single agency but necessitates cooperation from other sectors. Currently, "well-being" is used as a substitute for "health." It is believed that individual health is dependent on society. Health professionals should be prepared to support countries in accomplish health-related goals. Competency-based Education (CBE) is the preparation of individuals to possess the ability to integrate knowledge, skills, and attitudes in their work.

Universal Health Coverage (UHC) refers to the accessibility of healthcare services to all individuals, whether or not they have to pay for it, depending on the policies of each country. Everyone should be able to access healthcare services. UHC requires a strong healthcare system, healthcare professionals with knowledge and power to drive the healthcare system, and a workforce with strong capabilities.

Health professionals in the 21st century should have the following competencies: 1) clinical and public health competencies, 2) research skills, 3) communication skills with other professions, patients and families, society, and other people, 4) humanity, and 5) responsibility.

Thailand has been undertaking health professionals' education and training reform according Lancet's commission (2010) and WHO's guideline (2013) to shift from acquiring knowledge and medical expertise towards a more comprehensive approach that

emphasizes disease control, outcome assessment, and driving the healthcare system as a whole.

To meet these evolving needs, health professional education and training programs must adapt and expand their curricula. Some key strategies that can be employed to transform and scale up health professionals' education and training include: Interprofessional Education (IPE), Competency-Based Education (CBE), Continuous Professional Development (CPD), Technology-Enabled Learning and collaboration with stakeholders from health and non-health sectors at local and global level to improve health professionals' competencies.

Then, the participants were divided into groups to discuss six domains and competencies required for helping health professionals to implement UHC. Speakers suggested that participants discussed also approaches, methods, activities that have been implemented so far as well as challenges and obstacles they have faced. Afterward, participants presented their discussion results as follow:

Domain	Competencies	Approaches/methods/activities that have been implemented so far	Challenges/obstacles
Domain 1: People-centeredness	1. People-centered approach 2. Community empowerment 3. Culturally sensitive, respectful and compassionate care 4. Holistic care	- Assess the needs of the community before determining the area for data collection, using community assessment/health screening forms. - Emphasize service learning using the community as a center, under coordination with community leaders and health volunteers in bringing students for practical training. - Organize Community-Based Learning (CBL).	Challenges: - People may not understand their role and participation in health problems, as they have become accustomed to being passive recipients of healthcare services. Therefore, opportunities must be created for community participation at all levels. Obstacles: - Lack of resources, both in terms of personnel and equipment. - The differences in cultural, religious and healthcare practices between communities, present a challenge in implementing CBL. - It is difficult to provide sustained support and follow-up for health behavior changes, as students may change groups or withdraw from the program, leading to a lack of continuity. - The same location has been visited by many different institutions, leading to overcrowding and a lack of space.
Domain 2: Decision-making	5. Adaptive collaborative and rigorous decision-making	Promote decision-making skills by: - The teaching format is evidence-based and active learning is	Challenges: - Learners may lack experience in making

Domain	Competencies	Approaches/methods/activities that have been implemented so far	Challenges/obstacles
	6. Systematic decision-making 7. Solution-oriented approach 8. Adaptive and flexible to unexpected or changing situations	implemented in all subjects, both theoretical and practical. - Teaching techniques such as project-based learning, problem-based learning, simulation, scenario creation, patient-based learning, case-based learning, and particularly reflective learning are used. - Active learning processes are organized in all subjects.	flexible decisions so it is teacher's responsibility to develop learners' decision-making abilities. - Learners should also focus on data literacy. - Learners should learn how to use reliable information for decision-making. - Teacher should foster flexibility in decision-making. - How to develop learners understanding of responsible decision-making? - Teacher should emphasize the principles of ethics and morality. - How to enable educational institutions to support teachers in teaching decision-making skills through realistic simulations to help students develop decision-making abilities. - Develop mindset of both learners and teachers to recognize the importance of decision-making skills. Obstacles: - The cost of providing learning support for teaching through realistic simulations can be high.
Domain 3: Communication	9. Relationship management 10. Effective communication 11. Active listening 12. Purposeful information 13. Information sharing management	- Activities that can help develop students' communication skills include project-based learning, fieldwork, field research, and research projects as group projects. - Extracurricular activities could be integrated into interprofessional education, such as IPE and trans-professional courses. - For every profession, the curriculum should be based on outcome-based learning, with predetermined program learning outcomes (PLO) and course learning outcomes (LO), with milestones starting from interpersonal and social communication.	- A packed class schedule and a high number of credits in the curriculum need to be managed. - Students need to be prepared for local knowledge and community cultures. - It is challenging to align the timing and specific content of IPE courses across different professions. Therefore, clear policies should be established.

Domain	Competencies	Approaches/methods/activities that have been implemented so far	Challenges/obstacles
		- Modules should be separated to clearly define competencies, with central modules focusing on basic concepts, and integrated into each course. Screening and brief intervention workshops should be conducted, with practical modules accompanied by self-practice emphasizing the EPA competencies. - Electives that focus on communication and teamwork skills should be offered.	
Domain 4: Collaboration	14. Partner engagement 15. Trusted partnerships 16. Learning from, with, and about others 17. Tensions and conflicts management	- Project-based/ Field work	- The challenge is a tight class schedule and a large number of credits in the curriculum. - Students need to be prepared for local knowledge and community cultures.
Domain 5: Evidence-informed practice	18. Evidence-informed practice 19. Data and information assessment 20. Culture of safety and continuous quality improvement	- Prepare students for evidence-based practice by developing a plan for evidence-based practice throughout the curriculum. - Emphasize the importance of evidence-informed practice, and highlight the importance and level of reliability of evidences. - Apply existing clinical guidelines and collaborate with others using a participatory approach and students-centered approach. - Develop evidence-informed practice through exercises. - Apply evidence-informed practice in real-life situations. - Develop a system and guidelines for accessing and searching databases for references. - Teach students how to search for high-quality databases and how to evaluate the quality of empirical evidence. - Establish criteria for referencing empirical evidence. - Collaborate with organizations that serve as sources of reference. - Verify that the reference evidence is reliable and accurate to prevent errors in data and practice.	- The assessment form does not match the context of the course. - The process of preparing teachers to use empirical evidence is not serious and continuous. - Lack of assessment to develop evidence-informed practice. - There is insufficient knowledge management for evidence-informed practice. - Institutions have Limited involvement with the clinical setting. - There are differences in access to database containing evidence-informed practice. - There are budget constraints on procurement and support related to evidence-informed practice. - Fail to use assessment results for real development. - The quality culture that leads to safety, such as

Domain	Competencies	Approaches/methods/activities that have been implemented so far	Challenges/obstacles
		- Use the P-D-C-A cycle to ensure safety and continuous improvement.	managing the risk of academic work and safety in life, has not been seriously developed.
Domain 6: Personal conduct	21. Competence and scope of practice awareness 22. Ethical conduct 23. Lifelong learning and reflective practice 24. Health and well-being management	- Integrate knowledge and raise awareness of scope of practice in every nursing subject including law, ethics, and professional ethics, using case studies and simulations. - Adhere to professional standards and abide by relevant professional associations. - Faculty members should serve as role models for ethics, respecting patients' rights, honesty, integrity, and responsibility for learners to learn from. - Establish a system to honor and recognize outstanding faculty and learners regarding scope of practice. - Establish a student discipline/ethics committee. - Promote volunteerism and ethics both intra- and extra-curriculum through projects. - Utilize different approaches in teaching including self-directed learning (SDL), problem-based learning (PBL), creativity-based learning (CBL), and research-based learning (RBL). - Reflective learning should focus on creating a growth mindset (believing in continuous learning, creativity, and innovation. - Specify the necessary professional competencies throughout the curriculum and encourage lifelong learning. - Self-assessment of health (physical and mental). - Develop a personal development plan. - Implement a student support system with faculty advisors and class teachers. - Conduct annual health check-ups and vaccination records. - If abnormality is detected, learners should be referred to relevant networks for further assistance.	- Insufficient number of case studies for competency development, such as the COVID-19 outbreak situation and patient rights, which limit learning opportunities. - The inability to monitor information regarding scope of work and ethical conduct learners receive, especially from social media. - Different generations (faculty and learners) often have different perspectives on ethical conduct. - Various stress/values according to social media.

Speakers concluded that participants of this workshop could take effort in integrate these desired competencies into health professional courses they have been responsible for. They could even make collective effort in driving their institutions or health professional councils and consortia to reconsider curricula that support Thailand in achieving UHC.

From workshop feedback survey, most participants rated highly satisfied for the workshop's content, speakers, activities, logistics, duration. They also had change to connect with other participants from different professions and different institutions.

Conclusion

The project has successfully achieved its objectives in translating the "Global Competency and Outcomes Framework for Universal Health Coverage", developing physical and digital Thai version, and holding two workshops on 19 January, and 20 February, 2023 respectively.

The project provided a platform for Thai health professionals particularly from education sector, to discussed essential competencies needed to prepare future health professions for moving forward universal health coverage in Thai contexts.

The two workshops were videotaped with permission from participants according to Thai PDPA law. The videos were shared on NHPE's website for the public view.

Recommendations

Thailand should provide more platforms for discussion for each profession and/or each institution to consider incorporate these competencies in health professional courses/curricula to prepare health professional to serve society and support UHC.

Thailand would seek support from WHO and other development partners in providing regional platforms to discuss teaching and learning competencies necessary for Universal Health Coverage (UHC) to exchange experiences, best practices and lessons learned with other countries. WHO and other development partners could assist Thailand and other countries in designing effective education/training programmes to achieve UHC goals.